



A new covariant form of the equations of geophysical fluid dynamics and their structure-preserving discretization

8 April 2014, PDEs on the Sphere 2014

Werner Bauer

University of Hamburg

How to construct computational models

Set of geophysical fluid equations:

1 Define mathematical descriptors for: (i) particle movements

(ii) force fields

2 Solve balance of mass, momentum and energy \Rightarrow fluid equations

Set of geophysical fluid equations:

1 Define mathematical descriptors for: (i) particle movements

(ii) force fields

2 Solve balance of mass, momentum and energy \Rightarrow fluid equations

Descriptors mostly used in geophysical fluid dynamics (GFD):

- Particle movements \leftrightarrow Vectors \vec{v}
- Forces

$$\leftrightarrow$$
 Vectors \vec{F}



 \Rightarrow the fluid's velocity is described by the vector-valued equation of the form:

$$\frac{\partial \vec{v}}{\partial t} + \dots \propto \vec{F}$$

Set of geophysical fluid equations:

O Define mathematical descriptors for: (i) particle movements

(ii) force fields

2 Solve balance of mass, momentum and energy \Rightarrow fluid equations

Descriptors mostly used in geophysical fluid dynamics (GFD):

- Particle movements \leftrightarrow Vectors \vec{v}
- Forces \leftrightarrow Vectors \vec{F}



 \Rightarrow the fluid's velocity is described by the vector-valued equation of the form:

$$\frac{\partial \vec{v}}{\partial t} + \ldots \propto \vec{F}$$

Discretize vector-valued equations by, e.g. finite difference, finite element, ...

Are there other descriptors to represents the physical entities?

- Particle movements \leftrightarrow Vectors \vec{v}
- Forces \leftrightarrow Vectors \vec{F}

 \Rightarrow form of fluid equations: vector-invariant

 $\frac{\partial \vec{v}}{\partial t} + g \nabla h = 0$

Are there other descriptors to represents the physical entities?

- Particle movements \leftrightarrow Vectors \vec{v}
- Forces \leftrightarrow Vectors \vec{F} Linear map: Vectors \rightarrow Reals $\mathcal{F}: \vec{v} \rightarrow \mathcal{F}(\vec{v}) \in \mathbb{R}$

 \Rightarrow form of fluid equations: vector-invariant covariant

$$\frac{\partial \vec{v}}{\partial t} + g \nabla h = 0 \quad \forall \vec{v} : \frac{\partial}{\partial t} u(\vec{v}) + g \mathbf{d} h(\vec{v}) = 0$$

Are there other descriptors to represents the physical entities?

- Particle movements \leftrightarrow Vectors \vec{v}
- Forces \leftrightarrow Vectors \vec{F} Linear map: Vectors \rightarrow Reals $\mathcal{F}: \vec{v} \rightarrow \mathcal{F}(\vec{v}) \in \mathbb{R}$

 \Rightarrow form of fluid equations: vector-invariant covariant

$$\frac{\partial \vec{v}}{\partial t} + g \nabla h = 0 \quad \forall \vec{v} : \frac{\partial}{\partial t} u(\vec{v}) + g \mathbf{d} h(\vec{v}) = 0$$

Parts of this talk:

- 1 What are optimal mathematical descriptors?
- 2 How do covariant equations of GFD look like?
- 8 Application: derivation of structure-preserving discretization

Outline

1 Mathematical descriptors for fluid motion and forces

- 2 Structured covariant form of equations of GFD
- 3 Application: Structure-preserving discretization
- 4 Summary and Outlook

Description of movement of fluid particles

Physical properties of particle displacement:

- Displacement has direction and magnitude
- All positions should be accessible

Physical properties of particle displacement:

- Displacement has direction and magnitude
- All positions should be accessible

Mathematical model:

- Affine translation $a_{\vec{v}} = x \rightarrow x + \vec{v}$ in affine space A_n
- A_n set of point $\{x, V_x\}$ with vector space V_x

Physical properties of particle displacement:

- Displacement has direction and magnitude
- · All positions should be accessible

Mathematical model:

- Affine translation $a_{\vec{v}} = x \rightarrow x + \vec{v}$ in affine space A_n
- A_n set of point $\{x, V_x\}$ with vector space V_x

Conserved quantities under $a_{\vec{v}}$:

- Alignment and barycenter of points
- Ratio of distance between aligned pnts
- Parallel lines remain parallel Not conserved: distances, angles,



...

Description of forces

Physical properties of forces*:

- are not directly visible, only by e.g. particle displacement
- cause displacement $\delta \vec{v}$ that corresponds to work $W = F \cdot |\delta \vec{v}|$

Physical properties of forces*:

- are not directly visible, only by e.g. particle displacement
- cause displacement $\delta \vec{v}$ that corresponds to work $W = F \cdot |\delta \vec{v}|$

Mathematical model:

- Linear maps $\mathcal{F}_x: ec{v} \mapsto \mathcal{F}_x(ec{v}) \in \mathbb{R}$ in dual space V_x^* of V_x
- FORCE (covector): DISPLACEMENT (vector) \rightarrow WORK (real)

Physical properties of forces*:

- are not directly visible, only by e.g. particle displacement
- cause displacement $\delta \vec{v}$ that corresponds to work $W = F \cdot |\delta \vec{v}|$

Mathematical model:

- Linear maps $\mathcal{F}_x: ec{v}\mapsto \mathcal{F}_x(ec{v})\in \mathbb{R}$ in dual space V_x^* of V_x
- FORCE (covector): DISPLACEMENT (vector) \rightarrow WORK (real)

Properties of affine covectors:

- $\delta \vec{v}$ in kernel of \mathcal{F}_x span equipotential surfaces
- Line distance encodes amount of virtual work performed



Physical properties of forces*:

- are not directly visible, only by e.g. particle displacement
- cause displacement $\delta \vec{v}$ that corresponds to work $W = F \cdot |\delta \vec{v}|$

Mathematical model:

- Linear maps $\mathcal{F}_x: \vec{v} \mapsto \mathcal{F}_x(\vec{v}) \in \mathbb{R}$ in dual space V_x^* of V_x
- FORCE (covector): DISPLACEMENT (vector) → WORK (real)

Properties of affine covectors:

- $\delta \vec{v}$ in kernel of \mathcal{F}_x span equipotential surfaces
- Line distance encodes amount of virtual work performed

Given a metric: vector proxy \vec{F} given by $\mathcal{F}_x = <\vec{F}, >;$

- \vec{F} metric-dependent: $\mathcal{F}_x = < \vec{F}_{inch}, >_{inch} = < \vec{F}_m, >_m$
- *F* describes only particle trajectories, not whole field



Outline

1 Mathematical descriptors for fluid motion and forces

2 Structured covariant form of equations of GFD

- 3 Application: Structure-preserving discretization
- 4 Summary and Outlook

Topological equations:

$$\partial_t \int_{c} u + \int_{c} \mathbf{i}_{\vec{V}} (\mathbf{d}u + 2\Omega_{\mathrm{rot}}) + \int_{\partial c} \left(\frac{p}{\rho} + w + \kappa + \Phi_{A^n} \right) = \mathbf{0}, \quad \partial_t \int_{V} \widetilde{\rho} + \int_{\partial V} \widetilde{\rho u} = \mathbf{0},$$

Metric equations:

$$\widetilde{\star}
ho u = \widetilde{
ho u}, \qquad \widetilde{\star}
ho = \widetilde{
ho}, \qquad u^{\sharp} = \vec{V},$$

with energy closure for (i) incompressible or (ii) barotropic flows.

- n-dimensional rotating fluid equations
- Independent of choice of orientation
- Split equations agree with vector-invariant ones in
 ^R³

^{*}Bauer 2014 (submitted to GEM)

Topological equations:

$$\partial_t \int_{\mathcal{C}} u + \int_{\mathcal{C}} \mathbf{i}_{\vec{V}} (\mathbf{d}u + 2\Omega_{\mathrm{rot}}) + \int_{\partial \mathcal{C}} \left(\frac{p}{\rho} + w + \kappa + \Phi_{A^n} \right) = \mathbf{0} , \quad \partial_t \int_{V} \widetilde{\rho} + \int_{\partial V} \widetilde{\rho u} = \mathbf{0} ,$$

Metric equations:

$$\widetilde{\star}
ho u = \widetilde{
ho u}, \qquad \widetilde{\star}
ho = \widetilde{
ho}, \qquad u^{\sharp} = \vec{V},$$

with energy closure for (i) incompressible or (ii) barotropic flows.

- n-dimensional rotating fluid equations
- Independent of choice of orientation
- Split equations agree with vector-invariant ones in
 ^R³

Structure of equations suggests how to discretize them

```
*Bauer 2014 (submitted to GEM)
```

Topological momentum equation



- Inner orientation of *c* orients boundary
- Terms in units of specific energy density [*J*/*kg*]

$$\partial_t \int_c u =$$

 $u:\mathcal{X}(\mathcal{M}) \to \mathbb{R}$

velocity 1-form
$$u \in \Omega^1(\mathcal{M})$$

Topological momentum equation



- Inner orientation of *c* orients boundary
- Terms in units of specific energy density [*J*/*kg*]

$$\begin{split} & u: \mathcal{X}(\mathcal{M}) \to \mathbb{R} \\ & \zeta_{\mathrm{rel}}: \mathcal{X}(\mathcal{M}) \times \mathcal{X}(\mathcal{M}) \to \mathbb{R} \\ & \mathbf{d}: \Omega^{k}(\mathcal{M}) \to \Omega^{k+1}(\mathcal{M}) \\ & \mathbf{j}_{\vec{V}}: \Omega^{k}(\mathcal{M}) \to \Omega^{k-1}(\mathcal{M}) \\ & \vec{V} \in \mathcal{X}(\mathcal{M}) \end{split}$$

velocity 1-form $u \in \Omega^1(\mathcal{M})$ rel. vorticity 2-form $\zeta_{rel} \in \Omega^2$ exterior derivative interior product auxiliary vector field

$$\begin{array}{c} \partial_t \int_c u = -\int_c \mathbf{i}_{\vec{v}} \zeta_{\mathrm{rel}} & -f(\partial c_+) \\ +f(\partial c_-) & c & \partial c_+ \\ \partial c_- & \partial c_- & & \text{orients boundary} \end{array}$$

$$\begin{array}{c} \text{Inner orientation of } c \\ \text{orients boundary} \\ \text{orients boundary} \\ \text{Terms in units of specific energy density } [J/kg] \\ \partial_t \int_c u = -\int_c \mathbf{i}_{\vec{v}} (\overline{\mathbf{d}u + 2\Omega_{\mathrm{rot}}}) - \int_{\partial c} \left(\frac{p}{\rho} + w + \kappa + \Phi_{A^n} \right) \\ u : \mathcal{X}(\mathcal{M}) \to \mathbb{R} \\ \zeta_{\mathrm{rel}} : \mathcal{X}(\mathcal{M}) \times \mathcal{X}(\mathcal{M}) \to \mathbb{R} \\ \mathrm{for } u : \Omega^k(\mathcal{M}) \to \Omega^{k+1}(\mathcal{M}) \\ \zeta_{\mathrm{rel}} : \Omega^k(\mathcal{M}) \to \Omega^{k-1}(\mathcal{M}) \\ \mathbf{i}_{\vec{v}} : \Omega^k(\mathcal{M}) \to \Omega^{k-1}(\mathcal{M}) \\ \mathbf{i}_{\vec{v}} \in \mathcal{X}(\mathcal{M}) \\ \rho, \rho, w, \kappa, \Phi_{A^n} \in \Omega^0(\mathcal{M}) \end{array}$$

$$\begin{array}{ll} \partial_t \int_c u = -\int_c \mathbf{i}_{\vec{v}} \zeta_{\mathrm{rel}} & -f(\partial c_+) \\ +f(\partial c_-) & c & \partial c_+ \\ \partial c_- & \partial c_- & \bullet \end{array} \\ \bullet & \text{Inner orientation of } c \\ \circ & \text{orients boundary} \end{array} \\ \bullet & \text{Inner orientation of } c \\ \circ & \text{orients boundary} \end{array} \\ \bullet & \text{Terms in units of specific energy density } [J/kg] \\ \hline \partial_t \int_c u = -\int_c \mathbf{i}_{\vec{v}} (\mathbf{d}u + 2\Omega_{\mathrm{rot}}) - \int_{\partial c} \left(\underbrace{\frac{p}{\rho} + w + \kappa + \Phi_{A^n}}_{\rho} \right) \\ u : \mathcal{X}(\mathcal{M}) \to \mathbb{R} & \text{velocity 1-form } u \in \Omega^1(\mathcal{M}) \\ \zeta_{\mathrm{rel}} : \mathcal{X}(\mathcal{M}) \to \mathcal{X}(\mathcal{M}) \to \mathbb{R} & \text{rel. vorticity 2-form } \zeta_{\mathrm{rel}} \in \Omega^2 \\ \mathbf{d} : \Omega^k(\mathcal{M}) \to \Omega^{k+1}(\mathcal{M}) & \text{exterior derivative interior product} \\ \mathbf{i}_{\vec{V}} : \Omega^k(\mathcal{M}) \to \Omega^{k-1}(\mathcal{M}) & \text{interior product} \\ \vec{V} \in \mathcal{X}(\mathcal{M}) & \text{auxiliary vector field} \\ \rho, p, w, \kappa, \Phi_{A^n} \in \Omega^0(\mathcal{M}) \end{array}$$

Top. momentum equation is independent of metric and orientation



• Outer orientation of V^- and ∂V



- Outer orientation of V^- and ∂V
- Twisted forms: $\tilde{\rho} := \{\{{}^n \rho, Or\}, \{-{}^n \rho, -Or\}\}$

in -Or • Terms in units of mass-flux [kg/s]

$$-\partial_t \int_V \widetilde{\rho} =$$

 $\widetilde{
ho}:\mathcal{X}(\mathcal{M})^1 imes... imes\mathcal{X}(\mathcal{M})^n
ightarrow\mathbb{R}$

density *n*-form $\widetilde{\rho} \in \Omega^n(\mathcal{M})$



- Outer orientation of V^- and ∂V
- Twisted forms:

$$-\partial_t \int_V \widetilde{\rho} = \int_{\partial V} \widetilde{\rho u}$$

 $\widetilde{\rho}: \mathcal{X}(\mathcal{M})^1 \times \ldots \times \mathcal{X}(\mathcal{M})^n \to \mathbb{R}$ $\widetilde{\rho u}: \mathcal{X}(\mathcal{M})^1 \times \ldots \times \mathcal{X}(\mathcal{M})^{(n-1)} \to \mathbb{R}$

density *n*-form $\tilde{\rho} \in \Omega^n(\mathcal{M})$ mass-flux (n-1)-form $\widetilde{\rho u} \in \Omega^{(n-1)}(\mathcal{M})$



- Outer orientation of V^- and ∂V
- Twisted forms:

$$-\partial_t \int_V \widetilde{\rho} = \int_{\partial V} \widetilde{\rho u}$$

 $\widetilde{\rho} : \mathcal{X}(\mathcal{M})^{1} \times ... \times \mathcal{X}(\mathcal{M})^{n} \to \mathbb{R} \qquad \text{density } n\text{-form } \widetilde{\rho} \in \Omega^{n}(\mathcal{M}) \\ \widetilde{\rho u} : \mathcal{X}(\mathcal{M})^{1} \times ... \times \mathcal{X}(\mathcal{M})^{(n-1)} \to \mathbb{R} \qquad \text{mass-flux } (n-1)\text{-form } \widetilde{\rho u}$ mass-flux (n-1)-form $\widetilde{\rho u} \in \Omega^{(n-1)}(\mathcal{M})$

Top. continuity equation is independent of metric and orientation



• Matching orientations: ∂C_{\pm} outer orients V^{\pm} , *c* outer orients ∂V



$$\widetilde{\star}:
ho
ightarrow\widetilde{
ho}$$
 $[m^3]:[kg/m^3]
ightarrow[kg]$

- Matching orientations: ∂C_± outer orients V[±], c outer orients ∂V
- Unique map: $\widetilde{\star} : \rho \to \widetilde{\rho} := \{\{\star^3 \rho, Or\}, \{-\star^3 \rho, -Or\}\}$

• $\star: \Omega^k(\mathcal{M}) \to \Omega^{(n-k)}(\mathcal{M})$ in *n* dimensions



- Matching orientations: ∂C_± outer orients V[±], c outer orients ∂V
- Unique map: *⋆*: *ρ* → *ρ* := {{*³*ρ*, *Or*}, {- *³*ρ*, -*Or*}}
 *: Ω^k(M) → Ω^(n-k)(M) in *n* dimensions
- Unique map: $\widetilde{\star}$: $(\rho u) \rightarrow \widetilde{\rho u} := \{\{\star^2(\rho u), Or\}, \{-\star^2(\rho u), -Or\}\}$



- Matching orientations: ∂C_± outer orients V[±], c outer orients ∂V
- Unique map: $\widetilde{\star} : \rho \to \widetilde{\rho} := \{\{\star^3 \rho, Or\}, \{-\star^3 \rho, -Or\}\}$
 - $\star: \Omega^k(\mathcal{M}) \to \Omega^{(n-k)}(\mathcal{M})$ in *n* dimensions
- Unique map: $\widetilde{\star}$: $(\rho u) \rightarrow \widetilde{\rho u}$:= {{ $\star^2(\rho u), Or$ }, { $-\star^2(\rho u), -Or$ }}

Metric equations close the set of equations and provide metric information

Outline

- 1 Mathematical descriptors for fluid motion and forces
- 2 Structured covariant form of equations of GFD
- 3 Application: Structure-preserving discretization
- 4 Summary and Outlook

Example: Split linear shallow-water equations

Systematic discretization method:

- Discretize manifolds by computational meshes
- 2 Discretize differential forms by interpolation functions, e.g. finite element (piecewise constant, piecewise linear, ...)
- 3 Discretize metric equations, e.g. using diagonal matices

Discretization of the topological momentum shallow-water equation:

- Integral form: $\forall c \in \mathcal{M}$: $\partial_t \int_c u^1 + g \int_{\partial c} h = 0$
- Approximate manifolds: $\mathcal{M} \approx K, c \approx \sum_{e} e$
- Approximate forms: u^1, h piecewise constant $\Rightarrow u_e \approx \int_e u^1; \pm h_v \approx \int_{\partial e} h$



Discretization of the topological momentum shallow-water equation:

- Integral form: $\forall c \in \mathcal{M}$: $\partial_t \int_c u^1 + g \int_{\partial c} h = 0$
- Approximate manifolds: $\mathcal{M} \approx \mathcal{K}, c \approx \sum_{e} e$
- Approximate forms: u^1, h piecewise constant $\Rightarrow u_e \approx \int_e u^1; \pm h_v \approx \int_{\partial e} h$



- Integral form: $\forall c \in \mathcal{M}$: $\partial_t \int_c u^1 + g \int_{\partial c} h = 0$
- Approximate manifolds: $\mathcal{M} \approx \mathcal{K}, c \approx \sum_{e} e$
- Approximate forms: u^1, h piecewise constant $\Rightarrow u_e \approx \int_e u^1; \pm h_v \approx \int_{\partial e} h$



 \Rightarrow Matrix form of the **topological** momentum equation:

$$\partial_t \begin{pmatrix} u_{e_1} \\ \vdots \\ u_{e_{|K^e|}} \end{pmatrix} + g \begin{pmatrix} 0 & -1 \dots & 1 \dots & 0 \\ \vdots & \ddots & & \vdots \\ -1 & 0 \dots & 1 \dots & 0 \end{pmatrix}_{\mathbf{G}} \begin{pmatrix} h_{v_1} \\ \vdots \\ h_{v_{|K^v|}} \end{pmatrix} = 0$$

- $\mathbf{G} \in M(|K^{e}| \times |K^{v}|)$ is ± 1 if $v \in \partial e$
- Algebraic equation is metric-free

- Integral form: $\forall A \in \mathcal{M}$: $\partial_t \int_A \widetilde{h^2} + H \int_{\partial A} \widetilde{u^1} = 0$
- Approximate manifolds: $\mathcal{M} \approx K, A \approx \sum_{f} f$
- Approximate forms: $\widetilde{h^2}, \widetilde{u^1}$ piecewise constant $\widetilde{h}_f \approx \int_f \widetilde{h^2}, \pm \widetilde{u}_{\partial f} \approx \int_{\partial f} \widetilde{u^1}$



- Integral form: $\forall A \in \mathcal{M}$: $\partial_t \int_A \widetilde{h^2} + H \int_{\partial A} \widetilde{u^1} = 0$
- Approximate manifolds: $\mathcal{M} \approx K, A \approx \sum_{f} f$
- Approximate forms: $\widetilde{h^2}, \widetilde{u^1}$ piecewise constant $\widetilde{h}_f \approx \int_f \widetilde{h^2}, \pm \widetilde{u}_{\partial f} \approx \int_{\partial f} \widetilde{u^1}$



- Integral form: $\forall A \in \mathcal{M}$: $\partial_t \int_A \widetilde{h^2} + H \int_{\partial A} \widetilde{u^1} = 0$
- Approximate manifolds: $\mathcal{M} \approx K, A \approx \sum_{f} f$
- Approximate forms: $\widetilde{h^2}, \widetilde{u^1}$ piecewise constant $\widetilde{h}_f \approx \int_f \widetilde{h^2}, \pm \widetilde{u}_{\partial f} \approx \int_{\partial f} \widetilde{u^1}$



 \Rightarrow Matrix form of the **topological** continuity equation:

$$\partial_t \left(\begin{array}{c} \widetilde{h}_{f_1} \\ \vdots \\ \widetilde{h}_{f_{|\mathcal{K}^f|}} \end{array}\right) + H \left(\begin{array}{ccc} 0 & -1 \dots & 1 \dots & 0 \\ \vdots & \ddots & & \vdots \\ -1 & 0 \dots & 1 \dots & 0 \end{array}\right)_{\mathbf{D}^d} \left(\begin{array}{c} \widetilde{u}_{e_1^d} \\ \vdots \\ \widetilde{u}_{e_{|\mathcal{K}^e|}} \end{array}\right) = 0$$

- $\mathbf{D}^{\mathrm{d}} \in \mathit{M}(|\mathit{K}^{\mathit{f}}| imes | \mathit{K}^{\mathit{e}}|)$ is ± 1 if $\mathit{e}^{\mathrm{d}} \in \partial \mathit{f}$
- Algebraic equation is metric-free

- Continuous metric equations: $\widetilde{\star}: h \to \widetilde{h^2}, \ \widetilde{\star}: u^1 \to \widetilde{u^1}$
- Approximate to by diagonal matrices:
 - \star_0 : $\mathbf{h} \to \mathbf{\tilde{h}} = \frac{A_i}{1}\mathbf{h}$ • \star_i : $\mathbf{u} \to \widetilde{\mathbf{u}} = \frac{G_0}{2}\mathbf{u}$

- Continuous metric equations: $\widetilde{\star}: h \to \widetilde{h^2}, \ \widetilde{\star}: u^1 \to \widetilde{u^1}$
- Approximate to by diagonal matrices:
 - $\star_0 : \mathbf{h} \to \widetilde{\mathbf{h}} = \frac{A_f}{1}\mathbf{h}$
 - $\star_1 : \mathbf{u} \to \widetilde{\mathbf{u}} = \frac{\dot{d}_e}{l_e} \mathbf{u}$



- *****₀, *****₁ connect algebraic momentum and continuity equation
- Endows metric-free equation with metric information

- Continuous metric equations: $\widetilde{\star}: h \to \widetilde{h^2}, \ \widetilde{\star}: u^1 \to \widetilde{u^1}$
- Approximate to by diagonal matrices:
 - $\star_0 : \mathbf{h} \to \widetilde{\mathbf{h}} = \frac{A_f}{1}\mathbf{h}$
 - $\star_1 : \mathbf{u} \to \widetilde{\mathbf{u}} = \frac{d_e}{l_e}\mathbf{u}$



- *****₀, *****₁ connect algebraic momentum and continuity equation
- Endows metric-free equation with metric information



Benefits of this approach

- Switch primal and dual mesh ⇒ triangular C-grid scheme
- Tri/hex are structure-presering: $\mathbf{R} \cdot \mathbf{G} = 0$ and $\mathbf{D} \cdot \mathbf{R} = 0$
- Schemes are stable on uniform/non-uniform meshes



Outline

- 1 Mathematical descriptors for fluid motion and forces
- 2 Structured covariant form of equations of GFD
- 3 Application: Structure-preserving discretization
- 4 Summary and Outlook

Summary

- Differential forms optimally describe force fields
- Using straight/twisted differential forms, the equations are independent of orientation
- Split equations are ordered with respect to mathematical structures required (affine space + metric + orientation)
- Similarly structured discrete equations exist in literature (Cotter and Thuburn 2013, Bossavit 2005)
- The split form proposes a systematic discretization using algebraic approaches or finite element exterior calculus

Outlook

- · Further analytical studies of the split equations
- Use higher order FE to approximate differential forms
- Use non-diagonal Hodge star matrices